B U R G I S

# Memorandum 

| To: | West Windsor Zoning Board of Adjustment |
| :--- | :--- |
|  | West Windsor Division of Land Use |
| From: | David Novak PP, AICP |
| Subject: | Vishal Narula <br> d(4) Floor Area Ratio Variance |
|  | Block 27.06 Lot 128 <br>  <br> 14 Dickens Drive |
| Date: | October 25, 2021 |
| BA\#: | 3789.20 |
| WWT\#: | $21-03$ |

## Introduction

The applicant, Vishal Narula, has submitted an application seeking $\mathrm{d}(4)$ variance relief to construct a second story sunroom above an existing patio area. The site, which is identified by municipal tax records as Block 27.06 Lot 128, is located at 14 Dickens Drive in the R-20 Residence District.

In addition to the application forms and application checklists, the following has been submitted for review:

1. Construction Plan prepared by Cirangle Architects, undated, consisting of nine (9) sheets.
2. Survey prepared by A-1 Land Surveys, Inc., dated March 25, 2014 (no revision date), consisting of one (1) sheet.
3. Google Earth Aerial Map.
4. Site photographs and renderings.

## Property Desc ription

The subject site is located in the southerly portion of the Township, between the terminus of Dickens Drive and its intersection with Edinburg Road. The site has an area of 32,234 square feet and is somewhat rectangular in shape. It fronts along Dickens Drive for 141.79 feet and has a depth of approximately 200.00 feet at its greatest.

The site is presently developed with a two-story brick and frame dwelling which is setback approximately 26.5 feet from Dickens Drive. The dwelling has a footprint of approximately 3,200 square feet and, as per the Township's tax records, a total area of approximately 4,334 square feet. A brick patio, hot tub, stone patio, and walkway are located along the rear of the dwelling. Other improvements include a gazebo and a pond/stone feature. Access to the site is provided by a brick driveway which connects Dickens Drive to an attached three-car garage.

Surrounding land uses consist predominantly of single-family dwellings to the north, west, and south, as well as open space to the east. Please see the aerial at the end of this memorandum for an overview of the subject site and its surrounding environs.

## Proposed Improvements

The applicant proposes to construct a second-story sunroom near the northeasterly rear corner of the existing dwelling. The sunroom would have a depth of fifteen (15) feet and a width of twenty-five (25) feet, for a total area of approximately three hundred and seventy-five (375) square feet. Its façade will consist primarily of glass.

## Master Plan

As per the 2020 Land Use Plan, the site is located in the Medium Density Single Family Residential (R-20, R-20A, and R-20B) land use category, which is primarily located in the central and northerly portions of the Township. The 2020 Plan notes that this land use category is, for the most part, entirely developed with single-family dwellings with typical lot sizes of twenty thousand $(20,000)$ square feet. The main intent of this land use category and corresponding zoning district is to recognize and preserve the established character of these neighborhoods and to reinforce the prevailing minimum lot size of twenty thousand $(20,000)$ square feet.

## Zoning and " $\mathrm{d}(4)$ " Variance Relief

The site is located in the R-20 Residence District. The following table outlines the zoning regulations for the $\mathrm{R}-20$ District. Please note that that this zoning table was prepared by our office, and thus is an estimate to the subject site's compliance with the R-20 District bulk standards. The applicant should confirm these estimates.

Table 1: R-20 Resident District Bulk Standards

| Area \& Bulk Regulations | R-20 | Existing | Proposed | Section |
| :--- | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: |
| Minimum Lot Area (sf) | 20,000 | $32,234.00$ | $32,234.00$ | $200-173.2 \mathrm{~A}$ |
| Minimum Lot Width (ft) | 100 | 151.46 | 151.46 | $200-173.2 \mathrm{~B}$ |
| Minimum Front Yard (ft) | 40 | (ex) 26.50 | (ex) 26.50 | $200-173.2 \mathrm{C}(1)$ |
| Minimum Rear Yard (ft) | 30 | 94.30 | 94.30 | $200-173.2 \mathrm{C}(2)$ |
| Minimum Side Yard (ft) | 15 | (ex) $12.62 / 66.05$ | (ex) $12.62 / 66.05$ | $200-173.2 \mathrm{C}(3)$ |
| Maximum FAR (\%) | 13 | (ex) 13.20 | (V) 14.40 | $200-173.2 \mathrm{D}$ |
| Max. Improvement Cov. (\%) | 20 | (ex) 28.20 | (ex) 28.20 | $200-173.2 \mathrm{E}$ |
| Max. Building Height (st/ft) | $2.5 / 35$ | $>2.5 / 35$ | $>2.5 / 35$ | $200-173.2 \mathrm{~F}$ |

(ex) Nonconforming Condition; (V) Variance; *Indicated on Applicant's Rider;
As noted in the above table, the applicant has requested variance relief pursuant to NJSA 40:55D-70d.(4) of the Municipal Land Use Law (MLUL) for an increase in the permitted floor area ratio (FAR). For reference, "floor area" is defined by Section 200-4 of the Township's land use regulations as follows. Those portions of a building which are not included as floor area are underlined and italicized.

The sum of the gross horizontal areas of the several floors of a building or group of buildings on a lot, measured from the exterior faces of exterior walls or from the center line of party walls separating two buildings. Floor area shall not include roof overhangs less than three feet or any floors or portions thereof contained on terraces or balconies projecting beyond the exterior face of the building, areas occupied permanently by mechanical equipment,) any space where the floor-toceiling height shall be less than seven feet, provided that such space shall be used only for storage, building maintenance and operation activities, and roofed or enclosed areas devoted exclusively to off-street parking and loading spaces in excess of the number required by ordinance. Basements which satisfy applicable construction code definitions of habitable space, whether finished or unfinished, are included in floor area calculations for residential purposes.

Section 200-174E. establishes that the "FAR and MIC for clustered subdivisions in the R-20, R-20A, and R20B Districts approved prior to December 1, 2008 shall be based on a lot area of 32,670 square feet." Thus, the dwelling is permitted to have a FAR of thirteen percent ( $13 \%$ ) which equates to approximately $4,247.1$ square feet of floor area. The applicant has proposed a FAR of $14.4 \%$ or approximately 4,709 square feet of floor area.

## Statutory Criteria

The applicant has requested variance relief pursuant to N.J.S.A. 40:55D-70.(d)(4) of the Municipal Land Use Law (MLUL) for an increase in the permitted floor area ratio (FAR). As previously noted, the R-20 District establishes a maximum FAR of thirteen percent (13\%), whereas the applicant has proposed a FAR or fourteen percent (14.4\%).

An applicant requesting " $\mathrm{d}(4)$ " variance relief must demonstrate the positive criteria: specifically, that special reasons exist for the granting of the variance, and that the granting of the variance will further the purposes of the MLUL. In addition, the applicant must also address the negative criteria and demonstrate that there will be no substantial detriment to the public and no substantial impairment to the intent of the zone plan.

Randolph Town Center v. Township of Randolph, 324 N.J Super at. 416 provides guidance for Boards of Adjustments in evaluating applications requesting " $\mathrm{d}(4)$ " variance relief. In that decision, the Court held that in establishing special reasons for a FAR variance, boards should look to Coventry Square v. Westwood Zoning Board of Adjustment and not Medici v. BPR for guidance. Therefore, an applicant requesting "d(4)" variance relief does not need to show that the site is particularly suited for more intensive development. Rather, an applicant must demonstrate that the site will accommodate the problems associated with a floor area larger than that permitted by the ordinance.

In consideration of the above, the applicant and the Board should discuss the following issues:

## 1. Calculation of FAR

The applicant should confirm that the existing and proposed FAR was calculated pursuant to the Township's definition of "floor area." Specifically, the applicant should confirm that the calculated floor area does not include any of the provisions which are specifically exempt from that term.

## 2. Nature of Addition

Testimony should be provided as to the purpose of the proposed addition. Specifically, the applicant should discuss the proposed location of the addition, as well as its visibility from both the right-of-way and from adjoining properties. The applicant and the Board should also discuss the scale of the proposed addition in relationship to the scale of the remainder of the existing dwelling.

## 3. Number of Bedrooms

The applicant should confirm that the number of bedrooms is not proposed to increase with this application.

## 4. Comparison to Neighborhood

The applicant and the Board should discuss how the proposed FAR compares to the existing FARs in the surrounding area. To help visualize this comparison, we have provided the following table and map which identify those dwellings along Dickens Drive which exceed the FAR standard established by the R-20 District. This information was taken from the Township's tax information. In those instances where the FAR was unknown, our office provided an estimate based on Geographic Information Systems (GIS) data. Please note that pursuant to Section 200-174E., the FAR was based on a lot size of 32,670 square feet for all of the properties analyzed.

As shown, two (2) of the seventeen (17) dwellings in the surrounding area exceed the FAR standard established by the R-20 District.

Table 2: FAR Analysis

| Block | Lot | Property Location | Lot Size (sf) | Floor Area | FAR | Greater than Permitted FAR? |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 27.06 | 117 | 1 Dickens Drive | 29,882.2 | 3,408 | 10.43 | No |
| 27.06 | 118 | 3 Dickens Drive | 20,778.1 | 3,082 | 9.43 | No |
| 27.06 | 119 | 5 Dickens Drive | 21,562.2 | 3,540 | 10.84 | No |
| 27.06 | 120 | 11 Dickens Drive | 25,264.8 | 3,408 | 10.43 | No |
| 27.06 | 121 | 15 Dickens Drive | 19,994.0 | 4,182 | 12.80 | No |
| 27.06 | 122 | 17 Dickens Drive | 19,994.0 | 4,456 | 13.64 | Yes |
| 27.06 | 123 | 19 Dickens Drive | 20,037.6 | 3,550 | 10.87 | No |
| 27.06 | 124 | 21 Dickens Drive | 25,134.1 | 3,549 | 10.86 | No |
| 27.06 | 125 | 20 Dickens Drive | 23,696.6 | 3,831 | 11.73 | No |
| 27.06 | 126 | 18 Dickens Drive | 20,124.7 | 3,147 | 9.63 | No |
| 27.06 | 127 | 16 Dickens Drive | 19,994.0 | 3,517 | 10.77 | No |
| 27.06 | 129 | 12 Dickens Drive | 24,655.0 | 3,527 | 10.80 | No |
| 27.06 | 130 | 10 Dickens Drive | 24,655.0 | 3,597 | 11.01 | No |
| 27.06 | 131 | 8 Dickens Drive | 24,655.0 | 4,214 | 12.90 | No |
| 27.06 | 132 | 6 Dickens Drive | 24,655.0 | 4,071 | 12.46 | No |
| 27.06 | 133 | 4 Dickens Drive | 23,653.1 | 3,540 | 10.84 | No |
| 27.06 | 134 | 2 Dickens Drive | 26,963.6 | 4,286 | 13.12 | Yes |



Map 1: Aerial of Subject Site (scale: $1^{\prime \prime}=200$ )
https://burgis.sharepoint.com/sites/BurgisData/Shared Documents/W-DOCS/PUBLIC/Pb-3700series/Pb-3789.20/PB 3789.20 Vishal Narula - d(4) Variance (ZB 21-03).docx

Cc: $\quad$ S. Surtees, WWT CD
Barbara Watson, WWT CD
Lisa Komjati, WWT CD
Edwin Schmierer, Esq., Zoning Board Attorney


FAR Map: Comparison to R-20 FAR Requirement


